

Application No: 13/1022N
Location: 39, CHURCH LANE, WISTASTON, CW2 8HA
Proposal: Listed building consent for replacement windows
Applicant: Mr Joseph Richardson
Expiry Date: 16-May-2013

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION: Refuse

MAIN ISSUES:

- Principal of Development
- Design

REFERRAL

This application is to be dealt with under the Council's delegation scheme. However, Councillor Simon has requested that it be referred to Committee for the following reason:-

"To enable full consideration of the proposed replacement windows in a listed building".

DESCRIPTION OF SITE AND CONTEXT

The applicants property is a large two storey detached building, located in a prominent location adjacent to St. Mary's Church. The property is located within an extensive residential curtilage and is in a predominately residential area. The property is a Grade II Listed Building and is constructed out of red facing brick under a tile roof.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

This is a full application seeking Listed Building consent to replace the windows on the front elevation of the host property for Oak timber framed double glazed units at Church House Farm, Wistaston.

RELEVANT HISTORY

7/18127 - O/A for residential development – Approved – 27th September 1990
7/19855 - Residential development comprising 73 houses and 12 bungalows. PD rights removed under condition 6 – Approved – 29th August 1991
P91/0176 - Various temporary directional signs – Withdrawn – 15th January 1992

P91/0218 - Erection of 7 no dwellings on site frontage and substitution of house types. PD rights removed under condition 4 – Approved – 6th February 1992

P92/0686 - Substitution of house types. PD rights removed under condition 2 – Approved – 28th September 1992

P94/0387 - Substitution of house types (excluding Plot 50). PD rights removed under condition 2 – Approved – 2nd June 1994

P97/0379 - LBC for front porch and replacement window sills – Approved – 11th July 1997

P97/0539 - LBC for conversion of dairy room to conservatory and installation of UPVC windows and French doors – Approved – 21st August 1997

POLICIES

National Policy

The application should be determined in accordance with national guidance set out in:

National Planning Policy Framework

Local Policy

The principle issue surrounding the determination of this application is whether the development is in accordance with the following policies within the Borough of Crewe and Nantwich Replacement Local Plan 2011:

BE.2 (Design Standards)

BE.9 (Listed Buildings: Alterations and Extensions)

CONSIDERATIONS (External to Planning)

N/A

VIEWS OF THE PARISH / TOWN COUNCIL

No objections

OTHER REPRESENTATIONS

No representations received

APPLICANT'S SUPPORTING INFORMATION

No supporting information submitted with the application

OFFICER APPRAISAL

Principal of Development

The principle issues surrounding the determination of this application are whether the development would respect the pattern, character and form of the surroundings, in

accordance with policies BE.2 (Design Standards) and BE.9 (Listed Buildings: Alterations and Extensions) of the Borough of Crewe and Nantwich Replacement Local Plan 2011.

The main thrust of the Local Plan policies is to achieve a high standard of design, respect the pattern, character and form of the surrounding area, not adversely affect the street scene by reason of scale, height, proportions or materials used.

Development Control guidance advocated within the National Planning Policy Framework places a greater emphasis upon Local Planning Authorities to deliver good designs and not to accept proposals that fail to provide opportunities to improve the character and quality of an area. It specifically states '*Permission should be refused for development of poor design that fails to take the opportunities available for improving the character and quality of an area and the way it functions*'. (Para 64). It is considered that this proposal does detract from the character of the host property and will have a detrimental impact on the appearance of the area and is not in accordance with advice stated within NPPF.

Policy BE.9 (Listed Building: Alterations and Extensions) states that development proposals for the alteration or extension of a listed building, or any feature of special or architectural or historic interest which contributes to the reasons for its listing, will not be permitted unless:

- The proposal respects the scale, materials, colour, detailing and other significant features of the building concerned; and
- The proposal does not detract from the character or setting of the building concerned, especially with regard to its surrounding gardens, landscape, street scene or relationship with adjoining buildings and significant views.

The NPPF intimates that subsequent alterations to historic buildings do not necessarily detract from the quality of a building. They are often of interest in their own right as part of the building's organic history. Successful alterations require the application of an intimate knowledge of the building type that is being altered together with a sensitive handling of scale and detail. It is considered that the proposed alterations do not preserve the historic fabric of the building and the proposal is not in accordance with advice stated in NPPF and policy BE.9 (Listed Buildings: Alterations and Extensions)

Design

The applicant is proposing on replacing a number of windows on the front elevation of this Grade II Listed Building with timber framed double glazed units. It is noted that a number of other windows on the building have already been replaced with similar double glazed units. However, it is considered that the fabric of the building will always be an important part of the assets significance. Therefore, the retention of as much historic fabric as possible is therefore a fundamental part of any good alteration or conversion, together with the use of appropriate materials and methods of repair.

It is considered that the use of timber framed double glazed are unsympathetic alterations and the proposal would detract from the character and appearance of the host property. A more sympathetic approach is the use of secondary glazing which is advocated by the Conservation Officer. Overall, it is considered that the proposed alteration would have an adverse impact on the architectural and historic interest of this Listed Building, contrary to

advice advocated in Policy BE.9 (Listed Buildings: Extensions and Alterations) and the National Planning Policy Framework.

CONCLUSIONS AND REASON(S) FOR THE DECISION

The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposed use of timber framed double glazing does not respect the detailing of the original building and would have a significant adverse impact on the overall architectural and historic interest of this classically designed listed building. The proposal fails to safeguard the character and setting of the listed building and does not enhance the built environment, as such the proposal is contrary to Policies BE.2 (Design Standards) and BE.9 (Listed Building: Alterations and Extensions) of the Borough of Crewe and Nantwich Replacement Local Plan 2011 and advice contained in the National Planning Policy Framework.

Application for Listed Building Consent

RECOMMENDATION: Refuse approval

(c) Crown copyright and database rights 2013. Ordnance Survey 100049045, 100049046.

